

### Legislative Fiscal Bureau

One East Main, Suite 301 • Madison, WI 53703 • (608) 266-3847 • Fax: (608) 267-6873 Email: fiscal.bureau@legis.wisconsin.gov • Website: http://legis.wisconsin.gov/lfb

May, 2019

Joint Committee on Finance

Paper #270 -- Revised

## Pay Progression (District Attorneys, Justice, and Public Defender)

[LFB 2019-21 Budget Summary: Page 110, #2; Page 254, #11; and Page 311, #2]

#### **CURRENT LAW**

Under 2011 Act 238 and 2013 Act 20, assistant district attorneys (ADAs) and deputy district attorneys (DDAs) are compensated pursuant to a merit-based pay progression plan under which prosecutors may receive annual salary adjustments. Act 20 also established a pay progression plan for assistant state public defenders (ASPDs) and assistant attorneys general (AAGs) that mirrors the pay progression plan provided to assistant and deputy district attorneys. The merit-based pay progression plan consists of 17 hourly salary steps, with each step equal to one-seventeenth of the difference between an attorney's lowest hourly salary and the attorney's highest possible annual salary. Notwithstanding the creation of a 17 hourly salary step pay progression plan, District Attorneys, the State Public Defender, and the Attorney General may: (a) deny annual salary increases to individual ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs; or (b) increase the salary of individual ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs by up to 10% per year. In order to be eligible for pay progression, individuals generally must have served the state as an ADA, DDA, ASPD, or AAG for a continuous period of 12 months or more.

The District Attorney (DA) function has an annual GPR appropriation utilized to supplement salary and fringe benefit funding in order to support salary adjustments under the pay progression plan. The Office of the State Public Defender (SPD) had an annual GPR appropriation utilized to supplement salary and fringe benefit funding in order to support salary adjustments under the pay progression plan. Under 2017 Act 59, the SPD's annual GPR appropriation for salary adjustments for ASPDs was deleted. Instead, under the bill, funding for salary adjustments would be included in a biennial GPR appropriation utilized to support all operations of the SPD, but is separately accounted for within the appropriation. The Department of Justice (DOJ) had utilized existing resources, including discretionary settlement funds, to support salary adjustments for AAGs. Under 2017 Act 369, discretionary settlement funds are required to be deposited into the general

fund. This provision is currently under litigation.

The District Attorneys were authorized 363.45 ADA and DDA positions, including 314.15 GPR attorneys and 49.3 PR attorneys. The SPD is currently authorized 374.2 ASPDs, all of which are GPR-funded. The Department of Justice is currently authorized 101.40 AAG and AAG supervisor positions, including 78.25 GPR attorneys, 18.9 PR attorneys, and 4.25 FED attorneys.

#### **GOVERNOR**

Provide funding equal to a 2% increase for all ADAs, ASPDs, and AAGs on January 1, 2020 and 2021. No amounts are provided in compensation reserves for AAGs, ASPDs or ADAs for a general wage adjustment (2%/2% for other state employees in 2019-21). Rather, the 2%/2% amounts are included in the budgets of the three agencies and may be distributed at the discretion of the heads of the agencies.

#### **Assistant Attorney Generals**

Provide \$70,100 GPR, \$15,600 PR, and \$3,500 FED in 2019-20 and \$141,500 GPR, \$31,600 PR, and \$6,200 FED in 2020-21 to support pay progression plan for assistant attorney general attorneys.

#### **Public Defender**

Provide the State Public Defender \$320,600 GPR in 2019-20 and \$956,900 GPR in 2020-21 to support salary increases for assistant state public defenders under the pay progression plan.

#### **District Attorneys**

Provide \$307,300 GPR in 2019-20 and \$918,000 GPR in 2020-21 to support pay progression for assistant district attorneys and deputy district attorneys.

#### **DISCUSSION POINTS**

- 1. Under the 2017-19 state employee compensation plan established by the Division of Personnel Management in the Department of Administration (DOA), the minimum hourly salary for ADAs, DDAs, and ASPDs is \$25.14 per hour (\$52,291 annually), while the maximum salary for these employees is \$60.74 per hour (\$126,339 annually). [Due to supervisory responsibilities, DDAs and ASPD supervisors may earn up to an additional \$2.75 per hour (\$5,720 annually).] Generally, the compensation plan requires that ADAs be hired at the minimum salary level, while the SPD and DOJ are authorized to hire ASPDs at a rate up to \$42.94 per hour (\$89,315 annually).
- 2. The pay progression plan for these individuals exists to increase employee retention by creating a path for experienced attorneys to move from the minimum salary level to the maximum salary level. The pay progression plan consists of 17 hourly salary steps, with each step equal to one-seventeenth of the difference between the minimum salary level and the maximum salary level. One

full salary step totals \$2.09 per hour, or \$4,356 annually. Notwithstanding the creation these 17 steps, ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs may, at the discretion of their supervisor, receive up to a 10% increase in their salary on an annual basis until the attorney reaches the maximum allowable salary under the compensation plan. Once an attorney reaches the maximum salary level, the attorney may no longer receive salary adjustments under the pay progression plan. Under the pay progression plan, ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs are eligible to receive a salary adjustment after having been employed in such a position for 12 continuous months.

3. Table 1 identifies funding provided to the District Attorneys and the SPD for pay progression during the 2013-15, 2015-17, and 2017-19 biennia, as well as a brief description of how the funding was utilized. Table 1 also identifies amounts recommended in the bill for pay progression during the 2019-21 biennium. Note that similar information for funding allocated for AAG's for pay progression from 2014-15 through 2017-18 is provided in Table 2.

TABLE 1
Funding Appropriated for Pay Progression for the District Attorneys and the State Public Defender, 2013-14 through 2020-21

		District Attorneys		State Public Defender
	Appropriated		Appropriated	l
Fiscal Year	Amount	<u>Utilization of Funding</u>	Amount	<u>Utilization of Funding</u>
2013-14	\$1,018,400	Increase salaries of eligible attorneys to the next hourly salary step.	\$997,000	Increase salaries of eligible attorneys to the next hourly salary step.
2014-15	3,625,500	Increase salaries of certain attorneys by, on average, 6.6%, and provide other attorneys a one-time lump sum of \$2,000.	1,978,600	Increase salaries of eligible attorneys by, on average, 4.4%.
2015-16	0		0	
2016-17	556,900	Increase salaries for eligible attorneys by, on average, 2%.	481,300	Increase salaries for eligible attorneys attorneys by, on average, 2%
2017-18	1,005,700	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the District Attorneys. However, funding was intended to increase salaries of eligible attorneys by \$1.97 per hour.	1,280,300	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the State Public Defender. However, funding was intended to increase salaries of eligible attorneys by, on average 5%.
2018-19	2,606,000	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the District Attorneys. However, funding was intended to increase salaries of eligible attorneys by \$1.97 per hour.	2,607,300	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the State Public Defender. However, funding was intended to increase the salaries of eligible attorneys by 5%.
2019-20*	307,300	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the District Attorneys. However, funding is intended to fund a, on average, 2% increase on January 1, 2020.	320,600	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the State Public Defender. However, funding is intended to fund a 2% increase on January 1, 2020.
2020-21*	918,000	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the District Attorneys. However, funding is intended to fund a, on average, 2% increase on January 1, 2021.	956,900	Amounts may be utilized at the discretion of the State Public Defender. However, funding is intended to fund a 2% increase on January 1, 2021.

<sup>\*</sup>Information related to 2019-20 and 2020-21 are based on amounts included in the budget bill.

TABLE 2
Funding Utilized for Pay Progression for the Assistant Attorneys General 2014-15 through 2017-18

Fiscal Year	Funded <u>Amount</u>	% Increase over Base
2015	\$405,122	8.41%
2016	410,779	8.66
2017	384,550	6.59
2018	283,046	3.64

- 4. When budgeting for salary adjustments under the pay progression plan, greater amounts are typically appropriated in the second year of the biennium when compared to the first year of the biennium to support both: (a) any salary increases awarded in the first year of the biennium; and (b) any additional salary increases provided in the second year of the biennium. Ongoing support for any salary increases provided to ADAs, DDAs, or ASPDs during the 2019-21 biennium will likely be included in the DA's and SPD's full funding of continuing position salaries and fringe benefits standard budget adjustment included in the 2021-23 biennial budget bill.
- 5. Unlike the District Attorneys, the DOJ does not have a separate GPR appropriation to support salary adjustments for assistant attorneys general under the pay progression plan. Until 2018, DOJ supported salary adjustments through the utilization of existing resources, including discretionary settlement funds. Discretionary settlement funds were amounts received by DOJ as a result of certain litigation that may be expended by DOJ for any purpose permitted by state law, at the discretion of the Attorney General.

#### **Attorney Retention**

6. Table 3 provides information from the DOA's Division of Personnel Management (DPM) on the separation rates (rates of departure) from 2013-14 through 2017-18 for ADAs, ASPDs, and other nonsupervisory state attorneys.

TABLE 3

Rates of Separation by Non-Supervisory Attorneys

	FY12	FY13	FY14 <sup>1</sup>	FY15	FY16	FY17	FY18	
Retirement								
ADA	1.1%	1.7%	1.7%	3.1%	2.9%	3.2%	1.7%	
ASPD Attorneys	2.3	0.7	1.8	5.7	5.2	3.7	2.0	
Classified Staff Attorneys	5.0	4.6	2.2	5.5	6.8	5.7	4.8	
Non-Retirement Separations								
ADA <sup>2</sup>	8.0%	7.1%	7.4%	6.3%	6.3%	10.7%	7.0%	
ASPD Attorneys <sup>2</sup>	4.5	4.6	3.9	5.0	9.6	9.0	8.4	
Classified Staff Attorneys <sup>2</sup>	5.4	4.2	2.2	3.7	6.1	6.1	3.2	
Total Retirement and Non-Retirement Separations								
ADA	9.1%	8.7%	9.1%	9.4%	9.2%	13.8%	8.7%	
ASPD Attorneys	6.8	5.3	5.7	10.7	14.8	12.7	10.7	
Classified Staff Attorneys	10.3	8.8	4.4	9.2	12.9	11.9	8.0	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 2013-14 was the first fiscal year in which funding for pay progression was provided.

- 7. Appendix III and Appendix IV provide additional information compiled by DPM on separations from state service by permanent classified employees, by job group, (excluding the University of Wisconsin System) for 2016-17 and 2017-18, respectively. Note that the legal professionals and paralegals job group does not include ADAs and ASPDs, since ADAs and ASPDs are unclassified employees. As Appendix III indicates, the separation rate from state service by job group in 2016-17 ranged from 3.7% to 39.0%, while the average separation rate across all job groups was 13.8%. Appendix IV indicates that the separation rate from state service by job group ranged from 3.7% to 41.2% in 2017-18, while the average separation rate across all job groups was 13.6%. In comparing the separation data for the AAGs, ADAs and ASPDs (provided in Table 3) with other job groups in state service, it would appear as though the AAGs, ADA and ASPD separation rate has been similar to that of other job groups within state service. When comparing the data in Table 3 and Appendices III and IV, however, it should be noted that the job groups listed in Appendices III and IV vary in the level of professional training and education required to adequately perform the job.
- 8. While the salary provided to AAGs, ADAs and ASPDs has been identified as a key concern in the retention of these employees, there are many factors that may contribute to an employee's decision to remain employed with his or her current employer or seek opportunities elsewhere. The extent to which attorneys may leave state service due to dissatisfaction with salary levels cannot be answered based on the available data. It is likely that some resignations are related to salary issues, in whole or in part, while other resignations are unrelated to salary concerns.
- 9. The State Prosecutors Office (SPO) has provided data on employees vacating ADA positions from 2014 through April, 2019. During this time period, the SPO identified 341 ADA separations, of which 281 were departures (82.4%) and 59 were lateral transfers to other DA offices

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> These separations only include separations from state service. These separations do not include appointments to other positions in Wisconsin state service, such as appointment to a District Attorney position or state circuit court judgeship.

- (17.3%). Of these 281 departures, 28 (10.0%) were appointments to a deputy DA position or elections or appointments to a DA position. Further, 53 departures (18.9%) were due to retirement. In addition, 11 departures (3.9%) were due to layoff, position termination, health, disability, and death.
- 10. During the five and a half-year period, 79 departures (22.4%) were due to ADAs taking government positions with local units of government, the state, and the federal government, including 23 who became judges or elected representatives, 28 who took other state legal positions, and one who became a court commissioner. While these departures may have been motivated, in part, by salary dissatisfaction, they may also have been motivated by a desire for career advancement while still working in government, or for other reasons.
- 11. The remaining cases, which represent resignations from ADA positions for other reasons, total 68, or 21.4% of departures. Table 4 summarizes the variety of reasons provided for these remaining 68 resignations.

TABLE 4

Reasons for Certain ADA Resignations, 2014 Through April, 2019

Reason for Resignation	Number
Private sector (leaving state service)	44
Not Re-elected	7
Family	5
Moved out of state	3
Personal reasons	3
Military service	3
Financial Concerns	1
Lost Recall Election	1
Other work	_1
Total	68

- 12. As with the ADAs, it would appear as though attorney departures from the SPD likely occurred for a variety of reasons. Due to a change in data systems, the SPD does not have the ability to provide updated detailed information. The information from the last biennium is the latest available. The SPD identified 126 assistant state public defender departures from 2012-13 through 2015-16. Of these 126 ASPD departures, 42 were the result of retirements, six were the result of the attorney moving out of state or away from his or her home, two were the result of an attorney's family issue or a desire to stay at home, one was the result of a death, and one was the result of an attorney's desire to attend medical school.
- 13. Further, 33 attorneys separated from the SPD for a new job with another state agency, a District Attorney's office, a local corporation counsel or city attorney, the courts, a federal agency, or the Legislature. In addition, 24 attorneys separated from the SPD to accept either an unspecified position or a position in the private sector. While it is likely that salary dissatisfaction was a

contributing factor in several of these attorneys' resignation, it is also likely that career advancement or other personal decisions were a contributing factor. [Note that for the remaining 17 attorney separations from 2012-13 through 2015-16, information does not exist regarding the reason for resignation.] In total, during exit surveys conducted by the SPD, 69 attorneys separating from the SPD identified salary as a contributing factor for the reason for separation (although it should be noted that, according to the SPD, complete data from exit surveys does not exist).

- 14. Retention information for AAG's from 2011 through 2015 indicates that 45 assistant attorneys general departed from the Department of Justice. Of these 45 departures, 17 were the result of retirement, 21 were the result of the attorneys transferring to another state agency or other local or federal public sector entities, one was the result of the attorney accepting a job in the private sector, one departure was the result of the attorney failing to return from a leave of absence, one departure was the result of the attorney moving away from his or her home, and four departures were for unspecified reasons.
- 15. The Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS), U.S. Department of Labor, publishes monthly estimates of Wisconsin Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates. These occupational employment and wage estimates are calculated with data collected from employers in all industry sectors in metropolitan and nonmetropolitan areas in Wisconsin. Published monthly data on employer costs for employee compensation based on its National Compensation Survey. The surveys are conducted quarterly. The most recent published data for the four surveys conducted in 2018, indicates that for attorneys, wages and salaries averaged \$47.91 per hour. In addition, hourly wages in the 10th percentile were \$24.51, 25th were \$32.05, 75th were \$74.14, and 90th were over \$100.00 per hour.
- 16. During the same time period (2018) wages for ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs ranged from a minimum of \$24.15 to a maximum of \$58.37 per hour. The average salary of ASPDs was \$34.71 on April 15, 2018. The average salary of DAs and DDAs was \$34.46 on April 15, 2018. The average salary of AAGs was \$47.62 on April 15, 2018.

#### **Pay Progression Provisions Under the Bill**

- 17. Both the District Attorneys and the State Public Defender have identified the recruitment and retention of attorneys as an issue, and have identified compensation levels as a significant cause of the issue. The value of individual attorneys to DA offices and the SPD increases with time of service. With experience, the ability of these attorneys to address an increased caseload improves, and the quality of service that these attorneys can provide to the state and affected individuals also improves. In addition, when attorney turnover is reduced, DA offices and the SPD can minimize the resources that must be applied to the recruitment and training of new attorneys. Finally, in retaining quality staff, increased compensation can be a tangible way for the DAs and the SPD to indicate to the staff that the staff, and the work the staff performs, is valued.
- 18. The bill provides the District Attorneys, SPD, and Department of Justice with funding in order to support salary increases for assistant and deputy DAs, ASPDs, and AAGs under the pay progression plan. While the respective agencies would have discretion in administering pay progression amounts, the appropriated amounts under the bill are intended to support a 2% per hour pay increase to ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs eligible under the pay progression plan on January

- 1, 2020 and 2021. Total funding for pay progression for the DAs, SPDs, and DOJ is provided on a one-time basis, and would, therefore, not be included in the agencies base budget for the 2021-23 biennium.
- 19. Budget Bill. Given the benefits of reducing attorney turnover, the Committee could provide funding to both the DAs, SPD, and DOJ to support salary adjustments under the pay progression plan. Funding could be provided in the manner recommended by the budget bill [Alternative 1]. This alternative is intended to provide a 2% increase in 2019-20 and another 2% increase in 2020-21. This would result in DA pay progression funding totaling \$307,300 GPR in 2019-20 and \$918,000 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$320,600 GPR in 2019-20 and \$956,900 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$70,100 GPR, \$15,600 PR, and \$3,500 FED in 2019-20 and \$141,500 GPR, \$31,600 PR, and \$6,200 FED in 2020-21. Funding for pay progression would be provided on a one-time basis.
- 20. Bill and Technical Modifications. Amounts calculated for pay progression under the bill are based on payroll data from August, 2018. In addition, the amounts included in the bill do not account for the fact that pay progression funding provided to the DAs and the SPD is typically reduced in order to account for vacant positions. In addition, a number of ADA positions are PR funded and are technically unable to accept GPR supplements for pay progression. When authorized, additional amounts are billed to the authority providing the grant for pay progression. Further, funding for AAGs under the bill was intended to support a 2% increase on January 1, 2020 and 2021, but would only support a 2% increase on January 1, 2020.

If the Committee wishes to provide the pay progression levels recommended by the budget bill for the DAs, AAGs, and the SPD, but also wishes to account for these issues, the Committee could modify pay progression funding to support a 2% salary increase in January 2020 and 2021 by doing the following: (a) reduce DA funding under the bill by \$33,700 GPR in 2019-20 and \$100,600 GPR in 2020-21; (b) reduce the SPD's funding under the bill by \$20,300 GPR in 2019-20 and \$53,800 GPR in 2020-21; and (c) increase AAG funding by \$12,900 GPR, \$1,200 PR, and \$1,600 FED in 2019-20 and \$110,600 GPR, \$20,400 PR, and \$9,200 FED in 2020-21 [Alternative 2]. Alternative 2 would result in DA pay progression funding totaling \$273,600 GPR in 2019-20 and \$817,400 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$300,300 GPR in 2019-20 and \$903,100 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$83,000 GPR, \$16,800 PR, and \$5,100 FED in 2019-20 and \$252,100 GPR, \$52,000 PR, and \$15,400 FED in 2020-21.

21. If the Committee wishes to provide pay progression, but at a lower level than that recommended by the budget bill for the DAs, AAGs, and the SPD, the Committee could modify pay progression funding to support a 1% salary increase in January 2020 and 2021 by doing the following: (a) reduce DA funding under the bill by \$170,500 GPR in 2019-20 and \$506,300 GPR in 2020-21; (b) reduce the SPD's funding under the bill by \$170,400 GPR in 2019-20 and \$504,900 GPR in 2020-21; and (c) reduce AAG funding by \$28,600 GPR, \$7,200 PR, and \$900 FED in 2019-20 and \$15,400 GPR, \$5,700 PR, and increase by \$1,500 FED in 2020-21 [Alternative 3]. Alternative 3 would result in DA pay progression funding totaling \$136,800 GPR in 2019-20 and \$411,700 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$150,200 GPR in 2019-20 and \$452,000 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$41,500 GPR, \$8,400 PR, and \$2,600 FED in 2019-20 and

- 22. One-Step Increase for DAs and SPD. The Committee could increase the amounts provided to the SPD, DAs, and AAGs and support a one-step increase (\$2.09 per hour) on July 1, 2019-20 and 2020-21. In order to provide a step increase (and account for the issues identified under discussion point #20), the Committee could: (a) increase DA funding under the bill by \$1,212,900 GPR in 2019-20 and \$2,130,700 GPR in 2020-21; (b) increase SPD funding under the bill by \$1,384,100 GPR in 2019-20 and \$2,496,400 GPR in 2020-21; and (c) increase AAG funding by \$292,500 GPR, \$52,300 PR, and \$17,800 FED in 2019-20 and \$553,500 GPR, \$93,800 PR, and \$28,900 FED in 2020-21 [Alternative 4]. This alternative would result in DA pay progression funding totaling \$1,520,200 GPR in 2019-20 and \$3,048,700 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$1,704,700 GPR in 2019-20 and \$3,453,300 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$362,600 GPR, \$67,900 PR, and \$21,300 FED in 2019-20 and \$695,000 GPR, \$125,400 PR, and \$35,100 FED in 2020-21.
- 23. Various Percentage Increase. Alternatively, the Committee may wish to provide the DAs, SPD, and AAG with funding to support a different level of pay increase, as compared to what is provided under the bill. Under the pay progression plan, the maximum annual salary increase that may be provided to an ADA, DDA, ASPD, or AAG is 10%. Appendix I identifies the cost of providing the DAs, the SPD, and DOJ funding to support pay increases between 1% and 10% in July, 2019, and 2020 (rather than January 1, 2020, and 2021, under the bill) for ADAs, DDAs, and ASPDs, as a reflection of a change to the base. Appendix I also identifies the cost of providing one-full step under the pay progression plan (\$2.09 per hour). Appendix I identifies these costs if: (a) pay increases are provided in both years of the biennium; (b) pay increases are only provided in 2019-20; and (c) pay increases are only provided in 2020-21. Appendix II provides similar information for non-GPR fund sources within the Department of Justice.
- 24. *Delete Funding*. On the other hand, the Committee could decide to eliminate all funding for pay progression for ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs [Alternative 5]. This alternative would reduce funding under the bill for DAs by \$307,300 GPR in 2019-20 and \$918,000 GPR in 2020-21, reduce for SPDs by \$320,600 GPR in 2019-20 and \$956,900 GPR in 2020-21, and reduce DOJ funding by \$70,100 GPR, \$15,600 PR, and \$3,500 FED in 2019-20 and \$141,500 GPR, \$31,600 PR, and \$6,200 FED in 2020-21.
- 25. As pay progression is a commitment to move ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs from the minimum hourly salary available to these employees (currently \$25.14 per hour) to the maximum available hourly salary available to these employees (currently \$60.74 per hour), pay progression is a substantial ongoing financial commitment for the state. Further, since the state must continue to support the cost of past salary increases, the annual cost of supporting the pay progression plan builds on itself. For example, the cost of supporting a 5% annual salary increase for ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs under the pay progression plan would be \$3,164,000 GPR in 2019-20 and \$6,342,100 GPR in 2020-21. It is estimated that providing a similar 5% annual salary increase during the 2021-23 biennium would cost \$9,388,200GPR in 2021-22 and \$12,350,100 GPR in 2022-23 through full funding of salary and fringe benefits and additional funding for pay progression. The cost of pay progression for ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs would still be higher than these estimates if

funding is provided for 10% annual pay progression increases, as is allowable under current law.

26. The ultimate annual cost of pay progression, however, depends on turnover rates. A higher turnover rate reduces the annual cost of pay progression as more highly compensated attorneys would be replaced by lower compensated attorneys. It should be noted, however, that one of the goals of the pay progression plan is to reduce attorney turnover.

#### **ALTERNATIVES**

1. Budget Bill. Include the administration's recommendation to provide the DA pay progression funding \$307,300 GPR in 2019-20 and \$918,000 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$320,600 GPR in 2019-20 and \$956,900 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$70,100 GPR, \$15,600 PR, and \$3,500 FED in 2019-20 and \$141,500 GPR, \$31,600 PR, and \$6,200 FED in 2020-21. Funding would be provided on a one-time basis. Funding under the bill was intended to support a 2% per hour pay increase to ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs eligible under the pay progression plan on January 1, 2020 and 2021.

ALT 1	Chan	Change to					
	Base	Bill					
For DAs GPR	\$1,225,300	\$0					
For SPD GPR	\$1,277,500	\$0					
For AAGs	<u>s</u>						
GPR	\$211,600	\$0					
PR	47,200	0					
FED	9,700	_0					
Subtotal	\$268,500	\$0					
Total	\$2,771,300	\$0					

2. Budget Bill with Technical Modification. Provide DA pay progression funding totaling \$273,600 GPR in 2019-20 and \$817,400 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$300,300 GPR in 2019-20 and \$903,100 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$83,000 GPR, \$16,800 PR, and \$5,100 FED in 2019-20 and \$252,100 GPR, \$52,000 PR, and \$15,400 FED in 2020-21. Funding would be provided on a one-time basis. Funding is intended to support a 2% per hour pay increase to ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs eligible under the pay progression plan on January 1, 2020 and 2021.

ALT 2	Cha	ange to
	Base	Bill
For DAs GPR	\$1,091,000	- \$134,300
For SPD GPR	\$1,203,400	- \$74,100
For AAG	<u>s</u>	
GPR	\$355,100	\$123,500
PR	68,800	21,600
FED	20,500	10,800
Subtotal	\$424,400	\$155,900
Total	\$2,718,800	- \$52,500

3. *1% Increase*. Provide DA pay progression funding totaling \$136,800 GPR in 2019-20 and \$411,700 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$150,200 GPR in 2019-20 and \$452,000 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$41,500 GPR, \$8,400 PR, and \$2,600 FED in 2019-20 and \$126,100 GPR, \$25,900 PR, and \$7,700 FED in 2020-21. Funding would be provided on a one-time basis. Funding is intended to support a 1% per hour pay increase to ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs eligible under the pay progression plan on January 1, 2020 and 2021.

ALT 3	Change to					
	Base	Bill				
For DAs GPR	\$548,500	- \$676,800				
For SPD GPR	\$602,200	- \$675,300				
For AAGs						
GPR	\$167,600	- \$44,000				
PR	34,300	- 12,900				
FED	10,300	600				
Subtotal	\$212,200	- \$56,300				
Total	\$1,362,900	- \$1,408,400				

4. *One-Step Increase*. Provide DA pay progression funding totaling \$1,520,200 GPR in 2019-20 and \$3,048,700 GPR in 2020-21, SPD pay progression funding totaling \$1,704,700 GPR in 2019-20 and \$3,453,300 GPR in 2020-21, and AAG pay progression funding totaling \$362,600 GPR, \$67,900 PR, and \$21,300 FED in 2019-20 and \$695,000 GPR, \$125,400 PR, and \$35,100 FED in 2020-21. Funding would be provided on a one-time basis. Funding is intended to support a one step (\$2.09) pay increase to ADAs, DDAs, ASPDs, and AAGs eligible under the pay progression plan on July 1, 2019 and 2020.

ALT 4	Cha	Change to					
	Base	Bill					
For DAs GPR	\$4,568,900	\$3,343,600					
For SPD GPR	\$5,158,000	\$3,880,500					
For AAG	<u>s</u>						
GPR	\$1,057,600	\$846,000					
PR	193,300	146,100					
FED	56,400	46,700					
Subtotal	\$1,307,300	\$1,038,800					
Total	\$11,034,200	\$8,262,900					

## 5. Take no action.

ALT 5	Change to				
	Base	Bill			
For DAs GPR	\$0	- \$1,225,300			
For SPD GPR	\$0	- \$1,277,500			
For AAGs GPR	\$0	- \$211,600			
PR	0	- 47,200			
FED	0	- 9,700			
Subtotal	\$0	- \$268,500			
Total	\$0	- \$2,771,300			

Prepared by: Sarah Wynn

Appendices

Summary of Pay Progression Costs During the 2019-21 Biennium for the District Attorneys, the Office of the State Public Defender, and Department of Justice By Percent Increase Pay Increases in 2019-20 and 2020-21, Change to Bill\*

APPENDIX I

		District Attorne	eys	St	ate Public Defer	nder	Assis	tant Attorney C	Generals		Total	
Percent			2019-21			2019-21			2019-21			2019-21
<u>Increase</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>
Pay Increases in 2019-20 and 2020-21, Change to Bill*												
1%	-\$37,900	-\$368,200	-\$406,100	-\$26,800	-\$353,300	-\$380,100	\$12,900	\$27,800	\$40,700	-\$51,800	-\$693,700	-\$745,500
2%	231,400	169,600	401,000	267,100	248,700	515,800	96,000	196,500	292,500	594,500	614,800	1,209,300
3%	495,200	693,200	1,188,400	560,900	835,700	1,396,600	178,300	345,000	523,300	1,234,400	1,873,900	3,108,300
4%	753,100	1,210,200	1,963,300	847,600	1,416,600	2,264,200	259,900	485,700	745,600	1,860,600	3,112,500	4,973,100
5%	1,005,900	1,717,500	2,723,400	1,128,300	1,987,100	3,115,400	331,800	621,100	952,900	2,466,000	4,325,700	6,791,700
6%	1,255,800	2,221,700	3,477,500	1,407,500	2,554,500	3,962,000	402,900	744,200	1,147,100	3,066,200	5,520,400	8,586,600
7%	1,503,200	2,713,400	4,216,600	1,684,500	3,116,100	4,800,600	470,300	861,700	1,332,000	3,658,000	6,691,200	10,349,200
8%	1,748,300	3,196,400	4,944,700	1,956,900	3,661,500	5,618,400	537,100	975,500	1,512,600	4,242,300	7,833,400	12,075,700
9%	1,987,400	3,671,300	5,658,700	2,224,800	4,202,200	6,427,000	601,400	1,086,400	1,687,800	4,813,600	8,959,900	13,773,500
10%	2,225,900	4,139,500	6,365,400	2,490,700	4,737,300	7,228,000	664,900	1,188,000	1,852,900	5,381,500	10,064,800	15,446,300
One Step							\$292,500	\$553,500	\$846,000			
	* \$1,212,900	\$2,130,700	\$3,343,600	\$1,384,100	\$2,496,400	\$3,880,500	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	, ,	** ***	\$2,889,500	\$5,180,600	\$8,070,100
Pay Increase in 2019-20 Only, Change to Bill*												
10/	#27.000	ΦC44.400	Ф.CO.2. 200	# <b>2</b> < 000	0.556.600	Φ.CO.2 400	#1 <b>2</b> 000	Ф5 <b>7.2</b> 00	<b>044 400</b>	0.51,000	Ф1 250 200	Ø1 410 100
1%	-\$37,900	-\$644,400	-\$682,300	-\$26,800	-\$656,600	-\$683,400	\$12,900	-\$57,300	-\$44,400	-\$51,800	-\$1,358,300	-\$1,410,100
2%	231,400	-370,900	-139,500	267,100	-356,300	-89,200	96,000	26,900	122,900	594,500	-700,300	-105,800
3%	495,200	-102,900	392,300	560,900	-56,000	504,900	178,300	110,400	288,700	1,234,400	-48,500	1,185,900
4%	753,100	159,200	912,300	847,600	237,200	1,084,800	259,900	193,200	453,100	1,860,600	589,600	2,450,200
5%	1,005,900	416,100	1,422,000	1,128,300	524,400	1,652,700	331,800	266,300	598,100	2,466,000	1,206,800	3,672,800
6%	1,255,800	670,300	1,926,100	1,407,500	810,000	2,217,500	402,900	338,500	741,400	3,066,200	1,818,800	4,885,000
7%	1,503,200	921,900	2,425,100	1,684,500	1,093,500	2,778,000	470,300	407,100	877,400	3,658,000	2,422,500	6,080,500
8%	1,748,300	1,171,100	2,919,400	1,956,900	1,372,400	3,329,300	537,100	475,100	1,012,200	4,242,300	3,018,600	7,260,900
9%	1,987,400	1,414,500	3,401,900	2,224,800	1,646,800	3,871,600	601,400	540,500	1,141,900	4,813,600	3,601,800	8,415,400
10%	2,225,900	1,657,200	3,883,100	2,490,700	1,919,200	4,409,900	664,900	605,300	1,270,200	5,381,500	4,181,700	9,563,200
One Step							\$292,500	\$226,500	\$519,000			
Increase**	* \$1,212,900	\$634,000	\$1,846,900	\$1,384,100	\$795,900	\$2,180,000				\$2,889,500	\$1,656,400	\$4,545,900

## **APPENDIX I (continued)**

# Summary of Pay Progression Costs During the 2019-21 Biennium for the District Attorneys, the Office of the State Public Defender, and Department of Justice By Percent Increase Pay Increases in 2019-20 and 2020-21, Change to Bill\*

	District Attorneys		Sta	State Public Defender		Assistant Attorney Generals			Total			
Percent			2019-21			2019-21		-	2019-21			2019-21
<u>Increase</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u>Biennium</u>
Pay Increa	Pay Increase in 2020-21 Only, Change to Bill*											
1%	-\$307.300	-\$644.400	-\$951,700	-\$320,600	-\$656,600	-\$977,200	-\$70,100	-\$57,300	-\$127,400	-\$698,000	-\$1,358,300	-\$2,056,300
2%	-307,300	-370,900	-678,200	-320,600	-356,300	-676,900	-70,100	26,900	-43,200	-698,000	-700,300	-1,398,300
3%	-307,300	-102,900	-410,200	-320,600	-56,000	-376,600	-70,100	110,400	40,300	-698,000	-48,500	-746,500
4%	-307,300	159,200	-148,100	-320,600	237,200	-83,400	-70,100	193,200	123,100	-698,000	589,600	-108,400
5%	-307,300	416,100	108,800	-320,600	524,400	203,800	-70,100	266,300	196,200	-698,000	1,206,800	508,800
6%	-307,300	670,300	363,000	-320,600	810,000	489,400	-70,100	338,500	268,400	-698,000	1,818,800	1,120,800
7%	-307,300	921,900	614,600	-320,600	1,093,500	772,900	-70,100	407,100	337,000	-698,000	2,422,500	1,724,500
8%	-307,300	1,171,100	863,800	-320,600	1,372,400	1,051,800	-70,100	475,100	405,000	-698,000	3,018,600	2,320,600
9%	-307,300	1,414,500	1,107,200	-320,600	1,646,800	1,326,200	-70,100	540,500	470,400	-698,000	3,601,800	2,903,800
10%	-307,300	1,657,200	1,349,900	-320,600	1,919,200	1,598,600	-70,100	605,300	535,200	-698,000	4,181,700	3,483,700
One Step							-\$70,100	\$226,500	\$156,400			
Increase**	-\$307,300	\$634,000	\$326,700	-\$320,600	\$795,900	\$475,300	,	,	,	-\$698,000	\$1,656,400	\$958,400

<sup>\*</sup>The bill provides the DA's with \$1,066,100 GPR in 2017-18 and \$2,645,300 GPR in 2018-19 for pay progression and \$66,400 GPR in 2018-19 for pay progression.

<sup>\*\*</sup>One step under the pay progression plan totals \$2.09 per hour, or \$4,347 annually.

**APPENDIX II** Summary of Pay Progression Costs During the 2019-21 Biennium for the Attorney Generals Pay Increases in 2019-20 and 2020-21, Change to Bill\*

<b>.</b>	Assista	ant Attorney Gene		Assista	ant Attorney Gen	ttorney Generals (FED)			
Percent <u>Increase</u>	2019-20	<u>2020-21</u>	2019-21 Biennium	2019-20	<u>2020-21</u>	2019-21 Biennium			
<u>increase</u>	<u> 2019-20</u>	2020-21	<u> Dicilliulii</u>	<u>2019-20</u>	<u>2020-21</u>	<u> Dieiiiiuiii</u>			
Pay Increases in 2019-20 and 2020-21									
1%	\$1,200	\$3,400	\$4,600	\$1,600	\$4,100	\$5,700			
2%	18,100	38,700	56,800	6,700	14,500	21,200			
3%	34,900	63,900	98,800	11,800	20,000	31,800			
4%	51,800	88,900	140,700	16,900	25,500	42,400			
5%	63,900	110,200	174,100	19,800	31,100	50,900			
6%	75,500	128,100	203,600	22,500	36,700	59,200			
7%	87,200	142,800	230,000	25,100	42,400	67,500			
8%	98,700	155,000	253,700	27,800	46,100	73,900			
9%	108,600	167,200	275,800	30,500	49,800	80,300			
10%	118,200	178,300	296,500	33,100	53,600	86,700			
One Step									
Increase**	\$52,300	\$93,800	\$146,100	\$17,800	\$28,900	\$46,700			
Pay Increas	se in 2019-20 O	Only							
1%	\$1,200	-\$14,200	-\$13,000	\$1,600	-\$1,100	\$500			
2%	18,100	3,200	21,300	6,700	4,000	10,700			
3%	34,900	20,600	55,500	11,800	9,100	20,900			
4%	51,800	38,000	89,800	16,900	14,200	31,100			
5%	63,900	50,600	114,500	19,800	17,100	36,900			
6%	75,500	62,800	138,300	22,500	19,800	42,300			
7%	87,200	75,000	162,200	25,100	22,400	47,500			
8%	98,700	87,100	185,800	27,800	25,100	52,900			
9%	108,600	97,500	206,100	30,500	27,800	58,300			
10%	118,200	107,700	225,900	33,100	30,400	63,500			
One Step									
Increase**	\$1,290,900	\$1,313,300	\$2,604,200	\$1,704,700	\$1,752,800	\$3,457,500			
	se in 2020-21 O								
1%	-\$15,600	-\$14,200	-\$29,800	-\$3,500	-\$1,100	-\$4,600			
2%	-15,600	3,200	-12,400	-3,500	4,000	500			
3%	-15,600	20,600	5,000	-3,500	9,100	5,600			
4%	-15,600	38,000	22,400	-3,500	14,200	10,700			
5%	-15,600	50,600	35,000	-3,500	17,100	13,600			
6%	-15,600	62,800	47,200	-3,500	19,800	16,300			
7%	-15,600	75,000	59,400	-3,500	22,400	18,900			
8%	-15,600	87,100	71,500	-3,500	25,100	21,600			
9%	-15,600	97,500	81,900	-3,500	27,800	24,300			
10%	-15,600	107,700	92,100	-3,500	30,400	26,900			
One Step Increase**	-\$15,600	\$1,313,300	\$1,297,700	-\$3,500	\$1,752,800	\$1,749,300			
	,	· / /	+ / - / / - *	, - ,	· /· · - / · · ·	+ ) ) <del>-</del>			

<sup>\*</sup>The bill provides the AAG pay progression with \$15,600 PR and \$3,500 FED in 2019-20 and \$31,600 PR and \$6,200 FED in 2020-21.

\*\*One step under the pay progression plan totals \$2.09 per hour, or \$4,347 annually.

APPENDIX III

# Separations from State Service by Job Group 2016-17 Permanent Classified Employees Excluding UW System

			etirement	D. e		T + 1 + 11 C	
110	Average Coun		rations		ements	Total All S	
Job Group	in Job Group*	Number	Percent	<u>Number</u>	Percent	<u>Number</u>	Percent
Personal Care Aides	548	196	35.8%	20	3.7%	216	39.5%
Production Laborers	242	49	20.2	17	7.0	66	27.3
Health Care Technicians	1,830	377	20.6	56	3.1	433	23.7
Inspectors, Investigators, and Compliance	360	40	11.1	24	6.7	64	17.8
Power Plant	92	14	15.2	2	2.2	16	17.4
Food Production	398	57	14.3	12	3.0	69	17.4
Education Supervisors	30	1	3.4	4	13.6	5	16.9
Mechanical Equipment, Maintenance, Repair	397	32	8.1	34	8.6	66	16.6
Claims Determination	442	64	14.5	9	2.0	73	16.5
Administrative Support	2,889	294	10.2	142	4.9	436	15.1
Administrative Support-Fiscal	433	41	9.5	23	5.3	64	14.8
Health Care Professionals	1,246	134	10.8	50	4.0	184	14.8
Public Safety	5,395	610	11.3	165	3.1	775	14.4
Education/Training	692	61	8.8	33	4.8	94	13.6
Legal Professionals and Paralegals	371	28	7.6	22	5.9	50	13.5
Mechanical and Maintenance Supervisors	135	6	4.5	12	8.9	18	13.4
Social Services Professionals	2,965	299	10.1	95	3.2	394	13.3
IS Support, Program and Service Technicians	116	3	2.6	11	9.5	14	12.1
Program Specialists	284	20	7.0	13	4.6	33	11.6
Physicians and Health Care Practitioners	105	6	5.7	6	5.7	12	11.4
Service, Quality Control & Compliance Superv		10	5.2	11	5.7	21	10.9
Administrators-Senior Executives	536	19	3.5	39	7.3	58	10.8
Policy, Planning and Research	680	49	7.2	24	3.5	73	10.7
Mid-Level Supervisors	960	44	4.6	59	6.1	103	10.7
Business Professionals	325	16	4.9	18	5.5	34	10.5
Business and Program Area Supervisors	332	14	4.2	20	6.0	34	10.2
Fiscal	1,652	96	5.8	67	4.1	163	9.9
Natural Science and Laboratory Technicians	252	18	7.2	6	2.4	24	9.5
Craft and Trade	130	8	6.2	4	3.1	12	9.3
IS Professionals	1,258	50	4.0	65	5.2	115	9.1
Health and Social Services Supervisors	506	23	4.5	21	4.2	44	8.7
Science Professionals	249	10	4.0	10	4.0	20	8.0
Protective Services Supervisors	589	13	2.2	33	5.6	46	7.8
Physical, Natural and Social Science Superviso		5	2.9	8	4.7	13	7.7
Environmental Specialists	813	31	3.8	31	3.8	62	7.6
Architects and Engineers	1,295	51	3.9	47	3.6	98	7.6
Public Relations and Media Technicians	116	5	4.3	3	2.6	8	6.9
Property Management	110	3	2.7	3	2.7	6	5.5
Architect/Engineer Supervisors	123	1	0.8	5	4.1	6	4.9
Financial Supervisors	<u> 161</u>	2	1.2	4	2.5	6	3.7
Total	29,250	2,798	9.6%	1,224	4.2%	4,022	13.8%

<sup>\*</sup>Average counts for each job group are based on the average number of positions in each job group in September and June of the fiscal year.

APPENDIX IV

# Separations from State Service by Job Group 2017-18 Permanent Classified Employees Excluding UW System

		Non-Re	etirement				
	Average Count <u>Separations</u>			Retirements		Total All Separations	
<u>Job Group</u>	in Job Group*	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
B 16 411	551	212	20.70/	1.4	2.50/	227	41.20/
Personal Care Aides	551	213	38.7%	14	2.5%	227	41.2%
Education Supervisors	27	3	11.1	5	18.5	8	29.6
Food Production	395	77	19.5	18	4.6	95	24.1
Production Laborers	232	45	19.4	7	3.0	52	22.4
Health Care Technicians	1,785	323	18.1	40	2.2	363	20.3
Administrative Support	2,791	318	11.4	136	4.9	454	16.3
Mechanical Equipment, Maintenance, Repair	391	38	9.7	23	5.9	61	15.6
Administrative Support-Fiscal	445	43	9.7	25	5.6	68	15.3
Public Safety	5,352	647	12.1	169	3.2	816	15.2
Education/Training	689	55	8.0	43	6.2	98	14.2
Health Care Professionals	1,283	149	11.6	33	2.6	182	14.2
Physicians and Health Care Practitioners	100	7	7.0	7	7.0	14	14.1
IS Support, Program and Service Technicians	111	6	5.4	9	8.1	15	13.6
Inspectors, Investigators, and Compliance	352	32	9.1	14	4.0	46	13.1
Property Management	104	8	7.7	5	4.8	13	12.6
Claims Determination	424	44	10.4	9	2.1	53	12.5
Power Plant	97	7	7.2	5	5.2	12	12.4
Public Relations and Media Technicians	114	12	10.6	2	1.8	14	12.3
Fiscal	1,676	127	7.6	74	4.4	201	12.0
Social Services Professionals	2,976	269	9.0	85	2.9	354	11.9
Physical, Natural and Social Science Superviso		5	2.9	15	8.8	20	11.7
Mechanical and Maintenance Supervisors	139	8	5.8	8	5.8	16	11.5
Craft and Trade	130	5	3.9	9	6.9	14	10.8
Policy, Planning and Research	713	56	7.9	21	2.9	77	10.8
Architects and Engineers	1,236	61	4.9	65	5.3	126	10.2
Service, Quality Control & Compliance Superv	*	14	7.0	6	3.0	20	10.0
IS Professionals	1,280	78	6.1	49	3.8	127	9.9
Business Professionals	304	20	6.6	10	3.3	30	9.9
Health and Social Services Supervisors	513	30	5.9	20	3.9	50	9.8
Legal Professionals and Paralegals	372	17	4.6	17	4.6	34	9.1
Administrators-Senior Executives	532	20	3.8	28	5.3	48	9.0
Business and Program Area Supervisors	355	17	4.8	15	4.2	32	9.0
Program Specialists	289	19	6.6	6	2.1	25	8.7
Natural Science and Laboratory Technicians	235	9	3.8	10	4.3	19	8.1
Mid-Level Supervisors	1,003	30	3.0	50	5.0	80	8.0
Architect/Engineer Supervisors	119	4	3.4	4	3.4	8	6.7
Environmental Specialists	821	17	2.1	35	4.3	52	6.3
Protective Services Supervisors	610	10	1.6	28	4.6	38	6.2
Science Professionals	259	8	3.1		2.3	38 14	5.4
Financial Supervisors				6			
rmanciai Supervisors	<u>161</u>	2	1.2	4	<u>2.5</u>	<u>6</u>	3.7
Total	29,325	2,853	9.7%	1,129	3.8%	3,982	13.6%

<sup>\*</sup>Average counts for each job group are based on the average number of positions in each job group at the beginning and end of the fiscal year.