

## State of Misconsin 2019 - 2020 LEGISLATURE

LRB-0503/P2 MPG:ahe

## PRELIMINARY DRAFT - NOT READY FOR INTRODUCTION 2019 SENATE JOINT RESOLUTION

- 1 **To renumber and amend** section 8 (3) of article I; and **to create** section 8 (3) (a)
- 3. and 4. of article I of the constitution; **relating to:** release prior to conviction
  of a person accused of a crime (first consideration).

## Analysis by the Legislative Reference Bureau

This constitutional amendment, proposed to the 2019 legislature on first consideration, is explained in the PREFATORY NOTE provided by the Joint Legislative Council.

A proposed constitutional amendment requires adoption by two successive legislatures, and ratification by the people, before it can become effective.

## Resolved by the senate, the assembly concurring, That:

JOINT LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PREFATORY NOTE: This joint resolution was prepared for the Joint Legislative Council's Study Committee on Bail and Conditions of Pretrial Release. The Wisconsin Constitution provides that the legislature may authorize circuit courts to deny release to a defendant under either of the following circumstances:

- 1. The defendant is accused of committing a murder punishable by life imprisonment or a sexual assault punishable by a maximum imprisonment of 20 years.
- 2. The defendant is accused of committing or attempting to commit a felony involving serious bodily harm to another or the threat of serious bodily harm to another and has a previous conviction for committing or attempting to commit a felony involving serious bodily harm to another.

 $\mathbf{2}$ 

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

The constitution limits the period of time for which a person may be detained under a pretrial detention statute to 10 days before a pretrial detention hearing and 60 days following a pretrial detention hearing. The constitution also specifies that any pretrial detention law enacted by the legislature must contain a requirement that a court may detain a defendant following a pretrial detention hearing only if: (a) the court finds, by clear and convincing evidence presented at the hearing, that the accused committed the felony he or she is accused of committing; and (b) the court finds that the available conditions of release will not adequately protect members of the community from serious bodily harm or prevent intimidation of witnesses.

This joint resolution would modify the Wisconsin Constitution to allow the legislature to also authorize circuit courts to deny release to a defendant who is accused of a crime other than the types of crimes for which the constitution currently allows pretrial detention if there is a serious risk that the person poses a danger to another person or the community or there is a serious risk the person will not appear in court as required. This joint resolution would also eliminate the requirement that, to detain a person following a pretrial detention hearing, the court find, by clear and convincing evidence, that the defendant committed the felony he or she is accused of committing. In addition, this joint resolution makes nonsubstantive formatting revisions.

**Section 1.** Section 8 (3) of article I of the constitution is renumbered section 8 (3) (a) (intro.) of article I and amended to read:

[Article I] Section 8 (3) (a) (intro.) The legislature may by law authorize, but may not require, circuit courts to deny release for a period not to exceed 10 days prior to the hearing required under this subsection to a if any of the following apply:

- 1. The person who is accused of committing a murder punishable by life imprisonment or a sexual assault punishable by a maximum imprisonment of 20 years, or who.
- 2. The person is accused of committing or attempting to commit a felony involving serious bodily harm to another or the threat of serious bodily harm to another and who has a previous conviction for committing or attempting to commit a felony involving serious bodily harm to another or the threat of serious bodily harm to another.
- (b) The legislature may authorize by law, but may not require, circuit courts to continue to deny release to those accused persons for an additional period not to exceed 60 days following the hearing required under this subsection, if there is a

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

requirement that there be a finding by the court based on clear and convincing
evidence presented at after a hearing that the accused committed the felony and a
requirement that there be a finding by the court that available conditions of release
will not adequately protect members of the community from serious bodily harm or
prevent intimidation of witnesses.

- (c) Any law enacted under this subsection shall be specific, limited, and reasonable.
- (d) In determining the 10-day and 60-day periods, the court shall omit any period of time found by the court to result from a delay caused by the defendant or a continuance granted which was initiated by the defendant.

LC NOTE: Current law allows the legislature to authorize courts to detain defendants accused of committing certain crimes prior to trial. This draft would expand the circumstances under which pretrial detention could be authorized to allow the pretrial detention of a defendant accused of any offense prior to trial if there is a serious risk the defendant poses a danger to another person or the community or will not appear in court as required. Does this reflect the committee's intent?

LC NOTE: The Wisconsin Constitution currently provides that a person may be detained following a pretrial detention hearing if: (a) the court finds, by clear and convincing evidence presented at the hearing, that the accused committed the felony he or she is accused of committing; and (b) the court finds that the available conditions of release will not adequately protect members of the community from serious bodily harm or prevent intimidation of witnesses. This draft removes the requirement for the first of these findings. The constitution does not currently specify the burden of proof that applies to the finding that the available conditions of release will not adequately protect members of the community from serious bodily harm or prevent intimidation of witnesses. Does the committee wish to specify a burden of proof that should apply to this finding?

LC NOTE: Currently, the constitution limits the amount of time a defendant may be detained, under the pretrial detention procedure, to 10 days prior to a pretrial detention hearing and 60 days following that hearing. This draft does not change those time limits. Does this accurately reflect the committee's intent? If not, what time limits, if any, does the committee wish to include?

**Section 2.** Section 8 (3) (a) 3. and 4. of article I of the constitution are created to read:

[Article I] Section 8 (3) (a) 3. The court finds there is a serious risk that the person poses a danger to another person or the community.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

4. The court finds there is a serious risk that the person will not appear in court as required.

LC NOTE: The inclusion of a provision allowing pretrial detention for any crime in which there is a serious risk the defendant poses a danger to another person or the community or will not appear in court as required is patterned after the pretrial detention laws in New Jersey and the District of Columbia that the committee reviewed. New Jersey law also allows pretrial detention if there is a serious risk the accused "will obstruct or attempt to obstruct justice, or threaten, injure, or intimidate, or attempt to threaten, injure, or injure or intimidate, a prospective witness or juror." Does the committee wish to incorporate this factor into the Wisconsin Constitution as well?

**SECTION 3. Numbering of new provisions.** If another constitutional amendment ratified by the people creates the number of any provision created in this joint resolution, the chief of the legislative reference bureau shall determine the sequencing and the numbering of the provisions whose numbers conflict and shall adjust any cross-references to those provisions.

**Be it further resolved, That** this proposed amendment be referred to the legislature to be chosen at the next general election and that it be published for three months previous to the time of holding such election.

11 (END)