



Legislative Fiscal Bureau

One East Main, Suite 301 • Madison, WI 53703 • (608) 266-3847 • Fax: (608) 267-6873
Email: fiscal.bureau@legis.wisconsin.gov • Website: <http://legis.wisconsin.gov/lfb>

June, 2021

Joint Committee on Finance

Paper #430

Law Enforcement Equipment (Natural Resources -- Departmentwide)

[LFB 2021-23 Budget Summary: Page 416, #2]

CURRENT LAW

The Department of Natural Resources (DNR) Division of Public Safety and Resource Protection (PSRP) is responsible for enforcement of state laws regarding fish and wildlife, motorized recreation and environmental quality, as well as for ensuring public safety at DNR recreational properties. DNR law enforcement personnel may respond to incidents in coordination with other law enforcement agencies. Currently, DNR law enforcement staff use several different systems to issue and track citations, develop criminal reports, track and inventory evidence, dispatch and locate wardens and other law enforcement, and report uniform crime data.

DISCUSSION POINTS

Law Enforcement Equipment

1. DNR has 221 credentialed full-time wardens and 40 credentialed limited-term employee (LTE) wardens. DNR reports that in recent years, PSRP has adopted new technologies, including equipping nearly every warden with electroshock stun guns (Tasers), opioid-blocking naloxone (Narcan) and other supplies. Additionally, DNR indicates that tactical law enforcement equipment has evolved to rely heavily on network connectivity and portable cellular devices.

2. As PSRP has provided wardens with new equipment and access to national law enforcement databases, DNR reports that routine law enforcement costs have increased. Narcan and Tasers, for instance, have a relatively short lifespan, requiring replacement every two and five years, respectively. Additionally, DNR reports that the cost of this equipment has increased in recent years. For instance, in fiscal year 2015-16, DNR estimates that the Department paid \$1,400 per Taser and

associated equipment. In fiscal year 2019-20, DNR paid approximately \$2,000 for that same equipment, an increase of \$600. DNR replaces Tasers and other law enforcement equipment regularly, as they deteriorate or require service. Therefore, DNR incurs annual costs of replacement and servicing for this equipment. In fiscal year 2015-16, DNR did not equip officers with Narcan. DNR indicates that it equips all wardens with Narcan at a cost of \$80 per dose. Unused, they last two years.

3. Table 1 shows the cost per warden of new equipment. The table divides the cost per warden over the useable life of the materials to estimate an annualized cost. AB68/SB 111 would provide warden-carried equipment sufficient to equip 250 wardens. The table shows the cost reestimated to equip 261 wardens.

TABLE 1

Annualized Cost of Law Enforcement Equipment

<u>Warden-Carried Equipment</u>	<u>Increased Cost per Warden*</u>	<u>Wardens Equipped</u>	<u>Useable Life (Years)</u>	<u>Annualized Cost</u>
Tasers	\$600	261	5	\$31,320
Narcan	80	261	2	<u>10,440</u>
Subtotal				\$41,760

<u>Bureau-Wide Equipment</u>	<u>2015-16 Cost</u>	<u>2019-20 Cost</u>	<u>Relative Annual Cost Increase</u>
Transaction Information for Management of Enforcement (TIME)	\$10,500	\$12,000	\$1,500
Mobile Architecture for Communications Handling (MACH)	40,000	50,000	<u>10,000</u>
Subtotal			\$11,500
Total			\$53,260

* Price reflects increased cost relative to 2015-16.

4. Table 1 also shows the increase in annual licensing costs for law enforcement software relative to 2015-16. The Transaction Information for Management of Enforcement (TIME) system is administered by the Wisconsin Department of Justice. DNR and other agencies pay an annual assessment to license the software. DNR reports that TIME access cost \$10,500 in 2015-16 and \$12,000 in 2019-20, an increase of \$1,500. The TIME system provides PSRP and other law enforcement agencies with access to state and federal criminal justice databases. TIME allows DNR wardens to search criminal histories, warrants, and other criminal records to aid with investigations.

5. The Mobile Architecture for Communications Handling (MACH) software is administered by the Wisconsin Department of Transportation. DNR reports that the annual licensing

assessment for the software increased from \$40,000 in 2015-16 to \$50,000 in 2019-20, an increase of \$10,000. MACH is software that enables PSRP dispatchers and DNR wardens to connect with other law enforcement officers in the field to communicate, track locations, and dispatch officers to address incidents. MACH is integrated with the TIME database.

6. As shown in Table 1, the annualized cost of tools has increased by \$53,300. DNR reports that as these costs have increased, PSRP has had to reduce costs in other areas. PSRP has delayed trainings and acquisition of heavy equipment like snowmobiles and ATVs to stay within budgetary constraints. Additionally, PSRP reports that the Bureau has been unable to acquire time-saving technologies and certain updated mobile equipment to replace outdated technology. The Committee could increase the law enforcement base budget by \$53,300 annually to accommodate increasing routine costs. [Alternative A1]

7. Tasers have useable lifespans of five years. Unused, Narcan has a useable life of two years before it must be replaced. Access to MACH and TIME require PSRP to pay an annual license. Although DNR reports that PSRP replaces and repairs Tasers regularly, it could be argued that they should be replaced en masse through a master lease or other procurement process. Under this perspective, the Committee could consider increasing PSRP's base budget to accommodate the provision of Narcan to wardens and increased price of MACH and TIME access only, or \$21,900 SEG annually. [Alternative A2]

8. As described above, DNR reports that PSRP has accommodated the costs of acquiring new equipment by delaying procurement of law enforcement equipment such as snowmobiles and ATVs. It could be argued that it would be more appropriate to acquire these durable goods through a master lease, rather than through PSRP's base budget. Therefore, the Committee could take no action to increase PSRP's base budget. [Alternative A3]

Law Enforcement Records Management System

9. As law enforcement has become more reliant on mobile and cellular technology, some of PSRP's practices and databases, including public safety records management, have become outdated. DNR reports that the industry standard for law enforcement records management is to have an integrated software that is able to record and track investigations and law enforcement events from start to end.

10. PSRP's existing public safety records management system uses several different programs that are not integrated. AB 68/SB 111 would provide one-time funding of \$1,500,000 (\$62,300 GPR, \$93,400 environmental SEG, and \$1,344,300 conservation SEG) in 2021-22 to create an integrated records management system for PSRP. The bill would also amend three biennial appropriations created by 2019 Wisconsin Act 9 to acquire law enforcement radios. The appropriations, funded from the general fund, the SEG conservation fund, and SEG environmental fund, would be amended to allow DNR to acquire law enforcement technology, rather than only radios under current law, to fund the creation of the database. The proposal would divide funding among law enforcement functions as shown in Table 2. Funding was allocated among law enforcement appropriations based on the number of positions funded by each appropriation.

TABLE 2

DNR Records Management System -- 2021-23 Funding

<u>Program Area</u>	<u>Allocation</u>	<u>Fund</u>
General Program Operations	\$62,300	GPR
Environmental Enforcement	\$93,400	Environmental SEG
Fish, Wildlife, Parks and Forestry Enforcement	\$1,121,300	Conservation SEG
Boat Enforcement	145,400	
ATV Enforcement	62,300	
Water Resources Enforcement	<u>15,300</u>	
Conservation Fund Subtotal	\$1,344,300	
Biennial Total	\$1,500,000	

11. The records management system DNR intends to develop would integrate several law enforcement records and functions. The system would allow DNR wardens to have a single interface for most law enforcement reporting and investigation functions, and it would also integrate with other state law enforcement systems including MACH and TIME. DNR indicates that the system would reduce the time wardens spend on paperwork and would enable wardens to work more seamlessly with other law enforcement organizations.

12. In addition to enforcing fish and wildlife, motorized recreation, and environmental quality laws, DNR wardens may respond to other emergencies, as requested and as staffing allows. It is reasonable to conclude that the development of a streamlined and interconnected system would have a statewide impact as DNR wardens would be better connected to other law enforcement and would be better able to respond to emergencies across the state. Under this perspective, the Committee could consider providing one-time funding of \$1,500,000 (\$62,300 GPR, \$93,400 environmental SEG, and \$1,344,300 conservation SEG) in 2021-22 to develop an integrated records management software [Alternative B1].

13. DNR indicates that while PSRP has a broad understanding of what the records management system will enable wardens to do, the Department is still completing final specifications for the purchase. AB 68/SB 111 would provide procurement funding in three biennial appropriations. If DNR were unable to sign a procurement contract with a records management system designer and encumber the funds before June 30, 2023, the funds would lapse. DNR would be unable to finance the development and installation of the system without legislative appropriation. The Department expects to be able to encumber the funds by the end of the biennium. However, unexpected delays may impede DNR's ability to procure the system. Under this perspective, the Committee could amend the biennial appropriations, making them continuing, and to provide \$1.5 million for the acquisition of the records management system [Alternative B2]. This would provide certainty that funding would be available when DNR signs a contract.

14. Without detailed technical specifications, the \$1.5 million funding for the records

management system is subject to change. Since DNR has not begun the process of designing the system and identifying specific needs, it could be argued that it is premature to appropriate money to acquire the data system. The Committee could consider providing \$62,300 GPR in the Committee's supplemental appropriation pending further contract details. DNR would be allowed to request release of the funds once the Department has additional details on technical specifications and contractual costs. At that time, the Department could also request SEG funding for the law enforcement records management system. [Alternative B3]

15. Alternatively, the Committee could take no action to finance the acquisition of the records management system [Alternative B4]. DNR would be able to research and develop a specific plan for the records management system and request funding after the Department has a more detailed proposal for procurement. However, it should be noted that delayed funding may lead to greater costs in the future.

Data Specialist Personnel

16. In addition to funding the development of an integrated records management system, AB 68/SB 111 would reallocate 2.0 conservation SEG positions to the PSRP to manage the system. The bill would provide additional funding of \$13,900 in 2021-22 and \$61,400 in 2022-23 for the cost differential of the positions. The 2.0 additional positions to transfer would be 0.80 from wildlife management, 0.75 from parks, 0.25 from facility and property services, 0.18 from forestry, and 0.02 from fisheries management. All positions are currently vacant. The records system management positions would be funded at a total of \$142,500 conservation SEG in 2021-22 and \$190,000 in 2022-23.

17. DNR reports the 2.0 positions would be classified as data specialists. The positions would be primarily responsible for researching, developing, and installing the records management system. As noted above, PSRP has not identified all system specifications yet; the data specialists will be responsible for designing the system and identifying technical specifications. The data specialists will need to gather information on current PSRP records management procedures and departmental informational technology policies and capabilities to design the new system. DNR indicates that the data specialist positions will need to be in place before the Department can begin the procurement process.

18. After DNR enters a contract to develop the records management system, the data specialist positions will be responsible for system installation, deployment and training. Once the system has been installed and integrated into PSRP functions, the positions will be responsible for maintaining, updating, and supporting the system. DNR notes that, without the data specialists, the Department will be unable to develop and manage the system. DNR reports existing information systems and PSRP staff do not have the capacity to develop a new records management system while attending to current duties. The Committee could consider reclassifying the positions and providing an additional \$13,900 SEG in 2021-22 and \$61,400 SEG in 2022-23 to accommodate the increased position salaries and fringe benefits [Alternative C1].

19. Alternatively, the Committee could take no action to reallocate the positions [Alternative C2].

Body-Worn Cameras

20. Body-worn cameras have the potential to increase transparency in warden-civilian encounters as well as to provide for reliable evidence gathering. However, cameras raise privacy concerns and come with high acquisition, data storage and data management costs.

21. Body-worn cameras are estimated to cost between \$800 and \$1,200 per unit. The lifespan of the units varies. The Police Executive Research Forum, a law enforcement policy organization, estimates that a typical lifespan for the units is five years.

22. In addition to purchasing the camera equipment, there are a number of factors that would influence the cost of utilizing body cameras. These factors include: (a) costs associated with on- and off-site storage; (b) licensing fees for video management and editing software; (c) information technology infrastructure upgrades; (d) personnel costs associated with information technology, training, and other programming; and (e) costs associated with video transmission to the public or criminal justice system. For example, a provider of body-worn cameras to several Wisconsin law enforcement agencies stated in 2018 that its costs for services were \$79 per month per user.

23. AB 68/SB 111 would provide \$406,000 (\$16,800 GPR, \$25,300 environmental SEG and \$363,900 conservation SEG) annually to acquire body cameras and pay for data storage. There are different possible suppliers of cameras and different models, so a final cost for the cameras and data storage can only be determined after an RFP and procurement process, which has not occurred yet. DOA estimates that body cameras cost \$1,000 per unit and data storage costs \$100 per month. As noted above, the cameras have an estimated five-year lifespan. Therefore, the cost of acquisition (\$1,000) and five years of data storage (\$6,000) is estimated to be \$7,000 per body-worn camera.

24. At an annualized cost of \$1,400, the \$406,000 provided in AB 68/SB 111 would fund the acquisition of 290 cameras. DNR has 221 full-time wardens and 40 LTE wardens. The extra cameras could be used as needed in case a camera is damaged or needs repair. Given the public safety benefits of the cameras, the Committee could provide \$406,000 (\$16,800 GPR, \$25,300 environmental SEG and \$363,900 conservation SEG) annually to fund DNR acquisition of body-worn cameras. [Alternative D1]

25. Providing an increase in base funding would effectively allow DNR to divide the acquisition cost of body cameras of the life of the asset. However, this is inconsistent with other law enforcement technology purchases approved by the Committee in recent biennia. For instance, 2019 Act 9 appropriated \$4.6 million in one-time funding in biennial appropriations for the acquisition of 290 law enforcement radios.

26. Rather than provide funding for body-worn cameras on an annual basis, the Committee could provide one-time funding for acquisition and annual funding for data storage. DNR could procure 290 body cameras in the 2021-23 biennium and request funding for replacements in future biennia, as needed. Under this perspective, the Committee could provide \$290,000 (\$12,000 GPR, \$18,100 environmental SEG and \$259,900 conservation SEG) as one-time funding in DNR's biennial law enforcement equipment appropriations to acquire body cameras and provide \$348,000 (\$14,400 GPR, \$21,700 environmental SEG and \$311,900 conservation SEG) annually for data storage

[Alternative D2]. While this would increase state expenditures in the short term (\$638,000 in 2021-22, as opposed to \$406,000 under AB 68/SB 111), it would reduce ongoing expenditures.

27. It should be noted that over five years, Alternatives D1 and D2 would cost the same. Furthermore, DNR would be required to request additional funding in five years as the first tranche of body cameras are retired from service.

28. The Committee could take no action to approve the acquisition of body-worn cameras [Alternative D3]. There is no state requirement that law enforcement personnel be equipped with body cameras. Additionally, privacy considerations and the ongoing costs of data storage and licensing may counter some of the transparency benefits of the cameras.

ALTERNATIVES

A. Law Enforcement Equipment

1. Provide an increase to the DNR Division of Public Safety and Resource Protection base budget by \$53,300 annually to accommodate increasing routine costs.

ALT A1	Change to Base
SEG	\$106,600

2. Provide an increase to the DNR Division of Public Safety and Resource Protection base budget by \$21,900 annually to accommodate increased costs of Narcan and database access.

ALT A2	Change to Base
SEG	\$43,800

3. Take no action.

B. Law Enforcement Records Management System

1. Amend three biennial appropriations for law enforcement radios to allow DNR to acquire law enforcement technology. Provide one-time funding of \$1,500,000 (\$62,300 GPR, \$93,400 environmental SEG, and \$1,344,300 conservation SEG) in 2021-22 to develop an integrated records management software.

ALT B1	Change to Base
GPR	\$62,300
SEG	<u>1,437,700</u>
Total	\$1,500,000

2. Convert three DNR law enforcement radios appropriations from biennial to continuing, and authorize DNR to acquire law enforcement technology. Provide one-time funding of \$1,500,000 (\$62,300 GPR, \$93,400 environmental SEG, and \$1,344,300 conservation SEG) in 2021-22 to develop an integrated records management software.

ALT B2	Change to Base
GPR	\$62,300
SEG	<u>1,437,700</u>
Total	\$1,500,000

3. Amend three biennial appropriations for law enforcement radios to allow DNR to acquire law enforcement technology. Provide \$62,300 GPR in the Joint Committee on Finance supplemental appropriation in 2021-22. (This would allow DNR to request release of GPR and SEG funding for the integrated records management system when the Department has further technical and contractual detail on the system.)

ALT B3	Change to Base
GPR	\$62,300

4. Take no action.

C. Data Specialist Personnel

1. Reallocate 2.0 conservation SEG positions (0.80 from wildlife management, 0.75 from parks, 0.25 from facility and property services, 0.18 from forestry, and 0.02 from fisheries management) to the Bureau of Law Enforcement to develop and manage the records management system. Provide an additional \$13,900 SEG in 2021-22 and \$61,400 SEG in 2022-23 to accommodate the increased position salaries and fringe benefits.

ALT C1	Change to Base
SEG	\$75,300

2. Take no action.

D. Body-Worn Cameras

1. Provide \$406,000 (\$16,800 GPR, \$25,300 environmental SEG and \$363,900 conservation SEG) annually to fund DNR acquisition and data storage for body-worn cameras.

ALT D1	Change to Base
GPR	\$33,600
SEG	<u>778,400</u>
Total	\$812,000

2. Amend three biennial appropriations to allow DNR to acquire law enforcement technology. Provide \$290,000 (\$12,000 GPR, \$18,100 environmental SEG and \$259,900 conservation SEG) in 2021-22 as one-time funding in DNR's biennial law enforcement technology appropriations to acquire body cameras. Provide \$348,000 (\$14,400 GPR, \$21,700 environmental SEG and \$311,900 conservation SEG) annually for data storage.

ALT D2	Change to Base
GPR	\$40,800
SEG	<u>945,200</u>
Total	\$986,000

3. Take no action.

Prepared by: Eric R. Hepler